

## Quality matters in learning materials – but what do we mean by 'quality'



Tim Oates CBE | Group Director of ARD | 1<sup>st</sup> June 17

## Where are we now with learning resources?

A rhetoric of 'the future's digital...' – which can miss the point Lower costs of entry Difficult to capture and monetise innovation – openness of quality Increasing regulation – continuing state interest Digital companies hungry for return

In England – insidious effects of post-modern rhetoric Narrow instrumentalism Widespread failure to recognise the function of textbooks – now shifting

Government interest – attention, emphasis, funding, approval, regulation Transnational comparative work on quality and function – Michigan, Cambridge A start on self-improvement



Detected the vital role of textbooks in conveying the intentions of a National Curriculum

Reviewed the approach to textbook production and approval in a range of high performing jurisdictions

Initially reviewed over 200 textbooks in primary and secondary phase, using information element and writing frame analytics

Examined research on textbook usage internationally and domestically

Worked with UK Government and publishers on renewal strategy including reconfiguring supply and demand, development of principles for high quality materials, researched approaches to high quality digital materials



In England, during the 1980s and 1990s, there was a tendency towards a carefully-managed linkage between qualifications and textbooks/resources (Nuffield Biology, Suffolk Science, School Mathematics Project) – although an anti-textbook orthodoxy began to dominate teachers' thinking, stimulated by specific models of learning

England had no experience of the precise impact of high accountability arrangements; they have driven extreme instrumentalism into resources and textbooks

Textbooks seen as 'part of the steering mechanism' of education in Finland, and many high performing jurisdictions use an 'approved textbook' model

Stigler and Stevenson, Reynolds and Farrell find that highly effective teachers welcome high quality textbooks

Textbooks and resources are not simple, nor should they be seen as 'an afterthought'

Analysis of the role of textbooks in system improvement and system regulation

Analysis of the key distinctions in form, function and reception of digital resources – 'Digital is Different'



## Who are textbooks for?

### Directly

- Teachers
- Pupils (including writing in them)

### Indirectly

- Parents
- Awarding bodies
- Publishers
- The State
- Society



Finland – learning materials central to system

Hong Kong - carefully created market model

Singapore – vital underpinning research combined with high text form control and accompanying training/continuing professional development

Shanghai - vital role of textbooks in distilling good practice



## **Maths**

The 2011 the Trends in International Mathematics and Science Study (TIMSS) survey included collection of data on countries' use of textbooks and worksheets either as 'a basis of instruction' or to 'supplement' instruction:

Percentage of students whose teachers use...



### England Singapore Finland

Textbooks as a basis for instruction	10	70	95
As a supplement	64	23	3
Workbooks or worksheets as a basis	11	71	37
As a supplement	78	29	61
Concrete objects or materials	39	34	15
As a supplement	59	66	83
Computer software as a basis	24	16	5
As a supplement	74	80	69



## Science

Percentage of students whose teachers use...

Textbooks as a basis for instruction	4	68	94
As a supplement	45	27	6
Workbooks or worksheets as a basis	4	69	40
As a supplement	82	31	54
Science equipment and materials as a basis	62	60	7
As a supplement	38	40	90
Computer software as a basis	15	19	1
As a supplement	74	78	61

(Martin et al 2011)



**England Singapore Finland** 

### Aim and Purpose

The materials should be clearly targeted and their intended patterns of use made clear – aim and purpose. This should include clarity as to which group(s) the materials are aimed:

- Teachers/trainers/educators
- Pupils/learners
- Parents
- Technicians
- Learning assistants
- Other



## Mixing of modes and functions

#### A suite of materials for science for 11-16 year olds

Teachers' guide to a 11-16 science scheme Teachers' textbook with model lessons and a teaching sequence Set of pupil workbooks which include homework and practice activities Guide for running practical activities, providing a list of model experiments

Linked on-line assessments

On-line enrichment activities



## **Strategy in England**

#### Textbooks count – Nov 2014

There is an unacceptable level of market failure

A degree of collectivism may be an antidote

Quality needs to be defined and asserted through mutual critique and reoriented competitive focus

Long term strategy asserts the public good



## Fitting learning resources into a wider policy framework

- 1. Curriculum content (inc specifications, support materials, etc.)
- 2. Assessment and qualifications
- 3. National framework for qualifications
- 4. Inspection
- 5. Pedagogy
- 6. Professional development
- 7. Institutional development
- 8. Institutional forms and structures (e.g. size of schools, education phases)
- 9. Allied social measures (linking social care, health care and education)
- 10. Funding
- 11. Governance (autonomy versus direct control)
- 12. Accountability arrangements
- 13. Labour market/professional licensing
- 14. Allied market regulation (e.g. health and safety legislation, insurance regulation)

From Oates T 2010 Could do better: using international comparisons to refine the National Curriculum in England Cambridge Assessment



## **Case study**

Myths: Finland's improvement is caused exclusively by a shift to school autonomy AND 'Finland is top of the table'

5.3 million population

Commits the historical error of 'what it is like now is how it got there'

Ignores trajectory

Misses existing forms of restriction (curriculum time, routes post-16, A Levels)

Dirigiste control to effect a fully comprehensive system – the importance of ideas

Regulation of textbooks until 1990/94

Student association review of textbooks

Textbooks theorised as part of the 'steering system' of general education

Teachers highly respected – qualified to MA level; high demand for places – pay = Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) average – teacher training colleges centres of organised reaction against Soviet occupation

Location of restriction; retaining qualifications, emphasising high quality teacher training, less visible data monitoring



#### Chart 1: Finnish lower-secondary pupil performance in international assessments over time



Real Finnish Lessons Heller Sahlgren 2015



Concentration on a small number of attainable goals, mostly of an academic variety or concerned with the individual's relationship to society, rather than a spread of effort across many academic, social, affective and moral goals.

Mechanisms to ensure that things are taught properly the first time around, and that there is no 'trailing edge' of children who have to be returned to later (an example from Taiwan is that children have to repeat in the homework books any exercises that they got wrong in their previous homework).

The use of the same textbooks by all children, which permits teachers to channel their energy into classroom instruction and the marking of homework, rather than into the production of worksheets that is so much a feature of English teaching.

Reynolds and Farrell 1996 p56



## **Case study**

The error of the 'single point of authority' orthodoxy The error of 'top down imposition'

Complex bottom-up - top-down development and purpose of textbooks

Japan – lesson observation Singapore – history of development of maths materials Shanghai – extraction from practice

Singapore – outcomes of digital pilots





Shanghai: interesting issues of sequencing; and research-based production and refinement of textbook material



## **Conclusion?**

The power of textbooks and resources (as encoding of good practice, as support, needs to be recognised fully)

Jump straight to State-approved textbooks? State approval not the only route to quality

There should be far greater deliberation over design content and use – resources are central to appropriate 'curriculum control'



# Textbooks: their historical role as vital instruments for implementing a national curriculum (2013 Review)

#### Alberta

Authorised texts in core subjects Approved by 'Alberta Learning' Alternative texts available in approved lists, giving teacher choice

#### **Massachusetts**

No centralised textbook acquisition However, there exist centres of research and advice such as Associated Industries of Massachusetts (AIM)

#### Hong Kong

Textbooks approved by Hong Kong Education Bureau Schools are able to choose from a range of approved resources

#### Singapore

Textbooks approved by Ministry of Education Schools are able to choose from a range of approved resources



# Textbooks: their historical role as vital instruments for implementing a national curriculum (2013 Review)

#### Finland

Currently no explicit processes of State approval

Until early 1990s textbooks approved by Examining Office of the National Board of Education

#### England

No processes of State approval of textbooks However, substantial control of maths and English resources in Primary education during the late 1990s Powerful processes of 'endorsed textbooks' for examinations 2014 drive to enhanced quality based on international comparisons



### Aim and Purpose

The materials should be clearly targeted and their intended patterns of use made clear – aim and purpose. This should include clarity as to which group(s) the materials are aimed:

- Teachers/trainers/educators
- Pupils/learners
- Parents
- Technicians
- Learning assistants
- Other



#### For example:

A suite of materials for science for 11-16 year olds

Teachers' guide to a 11-16 science scheme Teachers' textbook with model lessons and a teaching sequence Set of pupil workbooks which include homework and practice activities Guide for running practical activities, providing a list of model experiments

Linked on-line assessments On-line enrichment activities



High quality materials typically include clear statements of 'how this textbook should be used and the purpose of different elements in the text'.

- 1. Extend and supplement learning and be used outside contact time does it structure and support home learning, learning beyond 'timetabled' time on subject, etc.
- 2. Supply reference material and/or activities which can be used in a highly flexible way by teachers
- 3. Provide structured activities which support or replace a very specific segment or segments of a learning programme
- 4. Provide a series of activities and content specifications which specify the sequence of learning and condition the learning activities

The degree of structuring and prescription of learning activities, and support to learners should be clear and justified/underpinned by evidence. The materials should specify clearly the domain which is covered:

Focus: specific discipline focus; cross curriculum focus etc.

Scope: specification of the 'domain' covered by the materials

Construct base: clear expression of the concepts, principles, fundamental operations and knowledge which is the focus of learning

Organising principles for domain specification: 'big ideas in the subject'; 'topics'; 'related ideas' etc.

Other structuring principles: use of practice; extended reading, etc.

Links to assessments and qualifications, including 'extending beyond the specification'



## Educational models driving the materials

Ideas regarding ability and progression can exert a powerful influence on the form and content of materials.

Deep learning – sequencing, spiral curriculum, rehearsal, concept checks

**Ability – differentiation** 

Practice

Production

Exposure



## Approach to assessment

- · How is the assessment scheduled in the materials?
- Who undertakes the assessment?
- How formal is the assessment?
- What is the purpose of assessment?
- Approach to standards setting/facility estimations/age standardisation?
- Does the assessment produce information of value to the teacher and to the learner?
- How are the assessments marked, is it externally validated, are mark schemes provided ?
- Is there assessment of pre-requisites for each segment of learning?
- Are there 'quick concept checks' to highlight key constructs and give rapid feedback?
- Are there assessment approaches which encourage learner reflection-e.g. a 'learning journal' or 'short reflections'?
- Are there example exam questions to help the learner become accustomed to question form and content?
- · What is the balance of different types of assessment?
- What is the balance between learning and assessment?

How dependable are assessments included in the materials, do they meet routine quality criteria regarding reliability, validity, construct integrity, consequential validity, and utility/manageability?



## Physical characteristics of materials, and production values

- Size and format, consistent with aims etc.
- Durability, consistent with intended patterns of use
- Relation between aims, authoring process and design, editorial processes
- Surface features consistent with learning model and other key principles
- Templates which are consistent with the structure of knowledge and the aims of the materials
- Justification provided for each information element and activity
- Has ethical review of the materials been undertaken
- Compliance with national guidelines on language, images etc.



# Training & support (CPD – Continuous Professional Development) alongside the materials

- What model of continuing professional development (CPD) is used in the supporting CPD what is the scheduling, content etc?
- Is CPD available to all consumers of the materials?
- What is the costing model for the CPD?
- What is being done regarding CPD, scope, content, underlying assumptions and models is the content of CPD consistent with the models in the materials?
- Are there means of evaluating the impact of CPD?



#### Market and marketing

- Projected sales volumes what is the estimation of market?
- Nature of market and market competition multiple suppliers etc.
- Marketing strategy
- Viability of costing model
- Relation to linked/parent qualification
- Endorsement strategy by Government, Awarding Body etc.

#### Underlying financial performance of the publisher

- Standard audit issues regarding capacity and resilience
- Market presence, geographical coverage
- Established reputation



#### Scheduling and production

- Trialling and development schedule the time allotted to the development process
- The extent to which the development is a refinement of prior materials and application of evaluation findings
- The form of the development process single author, authoring team, etc.
- Trialling in development with whom, how is it managed, what analysis and application of findings
- Have all necessary permissions for material been obtained?
- Are all legal agreements with authors regarding intellectual property etc. been put in place
- Lead time, publication/availability dates
- When CPD can be made available



#### **Evaluation and revision**

- Evaluation and revision strategy schedule and methods
- Impact analysis
- Reporting responsibilities and use of evaluation outcomes
- Analysis of standards of assessment and performance of learners
- Examination of learner performance enhancement of attainment
- Gaps between intended and actual patterns of use



#### **Regulatory compliance and conflicts of interest**

- Materials and the development and marketing processes should comply with regulatory requirements obtaining within the jurisdictions in which the materials will be used
- Nature and extent of conflicts of interest
- Mitigation of conflicts



Teaching quality – perhaps the most vital factor of all (John Hattie)

How do textbooks relate to the quality of the enacted curriculum?

Misinterpreting Singapore – missing learning models and principles, misunderstanding surface features such as repetition



Pre-requisites Review

Different forms of the equations of circles Features of circles from the equations Equations of circles from the different given conditions Intersection of a straight line and a circle

Learning objectives Problems Check through assessment: 6 problems, 1 practice exam Q, 1 lively maths problem Clear concepts/constructs Good elaboration through application Checking understanding

#### Spiral curriculum model



## Singapore – secondary maths

Chapter overview – story, topic – engagement Discover – learning outcomes Use of diagrams explained

#### Key ideas - concepts/constructs - margin notes - focus on concepts

Worked examples Did you know – interesting facts Guidance on the use of a calculator Exercises 'Time out activity' Journal writing task Summary – recap and revision – checking main concepts Revision paper Ten-minute concept check Review paper Enrichment maths



## Last generation GCSE textbook – KS4 Geography

Varied structure – complex

Higher tier elements Lower tier elements

299 pages Sample GCSE exam paper p11



## **Maths Primary Text - example**

Error of negative numbers through temperature scales Different scales Polar bears Penguins

Icebergs

Construct irrelevant variation



## Primary text – the life cycle





## Primary text – the life cycle





## Primary text – the life cycle - exposure





### Primary text – the life cycle - exposure





## New generation GCSE textbook – KS4 Maths



#### Using mathematics: real-life applications



Everyone uses numbers on a daily basis often without really thinking about them. Shopping, cooking, working out bills, paying for transport and measuring all rely on a good understanding of numbers and calculation skills.

You probably already know most of the concepts in this chapter. They have been included so that you can revise concepts if you need to and check that you know them well.



"Number puzzles and games are very popular and there are mobile apps and games available for all age groups. Our website offers free games where you have to identify the correct order of operations to use to solve different number puzzles." (Website designer)

#### Before you start ...

KS3	You should be able to	<ol> <li>Copy and complete each</li> </ol>	n statement to make it tru	le.
	and divide positive and negative numbers.	Use only <, = or >. <b>a</b> $2 + 3 \square 4 - 7$ <b>c</b> $-1 - 4 \square 20 \div -4$	<b>b</b> $-3 + 6$ <b>d</b> $-6 \times 2$	4 - 7 75
KS3	You should know the rules for working when more than one operation is involved in a calculation (BIDMAS).	<ul> <li>2 Spot the mistake in each</li> <li>a 3 + 8 + 3 × 4 = 56</li> <li>b 3 + 8 × 3 + 4 = 37</li> <li>c 3 × (8 + 3) × 4 = 130</li> </ul>	calculation and correct	the answers.
KS3	You should understand that addition and	3 Identify the inverse oper <b>a</b> $14 \times 4 = 56$	ation by choosing the co	rrect option.
	subtraction, and multiplication and division, are inverse	<b>b</b> $36 \times 4 = 14$ <b>b</b> $200 \div 10 = 20$	B $14 \div 4 = 56$	C $56 \div 4 = 14$
	operations.	<b>a</b> $200 \div 20 = 10$ <b>c</b> $27 + 53 = 80$	$B  200 = 10 \times 20$	C $10 \times 200 = 2000$
		A $80 = 4 \times 20$	B $80 - 27 = 53$	C $80 + 27 = 107$

The constructed line is perpendicular to AB, so it is called the perpendicular bisector of AB.

Constructing perpendiculars

You can use your pair of compasses to construct:

- a line perpendicular to any point on a given line.
- a perpendicular line from a point above or below a given line.

Construct a perpendicular at a given point on a line



Construct a perpendicular from a point to a line

The shortest distance from any point to a line, is the perpendicular distance from the point to the line.

#### WORKED EXAMPLE 5



#### 6 Construction and loci



perpendicular bisector: a line perpendicular to another that also cuts it in half.



Remember perpendicular means 'at right angles to'.



Remember the symbol ⊥ means 'perpendicular to'; see Chapter 5 if you need to.

## Giving people what they need rather than what they want

Are market forces enough? Asymmetry and imperfections Competing on 'quality' – but what does 'quality' mean?

The need for action

The need for moral purpose and ruthless self monitoring

The need for discussion and constant analysis



# Bad textbooks are problematic, good textbooks are necessary but not sufficient



## What are the features of a good textbook?

Evidence-based in all its information elements and features

Informed by coherent underpinning learning model

Specifies the domain with precision and good structure

Specifies key constructs with precision and clarity, with all information elements and formatting reinforcing the key constructs

Includes high quality pre-assessment, on-going assessment and summative assessment

Practice, production, exposure

Curriculum and assessment linkage - but expansive, not instrumental



#### Ted Nelson 1987

'...the question is not can we do everything on screens, but when will we, how will we, and how can we make it great? This is an article of faith – its simple obviousness defies argument...'

#### Paradox

"...You will be destined for disappointment if your strategy is based on comparing the unmanaged disadvantages of the old with the utopian advantages of the new..."



Research on digital so far - Read more, learn less



#### Research on digital so far - Read more, learn less

Paper beats computer screens – Science Nordic Young people prefer to read on screen – BBC education Reading on computer screens motivates boys to read – Literacy News Computers 'do not improve' pupil results says OECD – BBC education

Finland – digital resources as systemic innovation – OECD ILL Inter-library loan – the impact of on-line provision in library services

1970s-present – research on comprehension and recall



'...once I was a scuba diver in a sea of words...now I zip along the surface like a guy on a jet ski...'

Nicholas Carr 2008 Is Google making us stupid? What the internet is doing to our brains '...is this digital versus paper just a cipher for a discussion about the philosophy of education; the things which make good education?...'

Battle of Ideas – London 2016



Shanghai: interesting issues of sequencing; and research-based production and refinement of textbook material



## Right now...

Evangelists positing false oppositions – Richard Culatta Highest quality developments are mixed media – Isaac; CUP Quality variation and low initial concern for quality – Simon Peyton Jones Wrong composition of development teams – IT versus pedagogy and assessment Examples of successful implementation occurring – Chesterton versus East London Those from lower SES are less able to use technology for learning Self-directed learning presupposes skills not evenly spread re SES - Abadzi Inadequate research on search behaviours and interest focus – schema Inadequate research on demarcations in social sphere – what kids actually do

When does 'following preference' become systemic disadvantage – Oates



#### Singapore 2012

Evaluation of development projects to implement electronic resources encountered significant practical difficulties regarding equipment and connectivity; but also difficulties in retaining the functions of previous paper-based materials

Plus significant findings from psychological studies of the use, learning processes and impact of digital materials



Highly correlated with high attainment

Children who write more, think more. They are able to see and review their writing, and thus are able to reflect on the way they are thinking.

Teachers gain more insight into children's thoughts and provide more guidance and feedback

Writing enhances psychomotor co-ordination, a concern with precision, and a sense of 'audience'

Reading encourages persistence and attention as well as knowledge retention and thought

What is replacing writing in schools? – Eton and Harrow Writing on screen is not identical to writing on paper Autocorrection of spelling and grammar Automatic legibility of print form Ease of correction



## Subject schemas

#### **Domain conception**

The learner is naïve Romantic conceptions of 'natural' growth The specific nature of discipline knowledge

developing foundational concepts identifying and immediately addressing misconceptions making links and connections between concepts consolidating and rehearsing

Confucian conceptions of learning 'all children capable of anything depending on the way in which it is presented to them and the effort which they put into learning it...'

Guide Authority



## Reading on screen is not identical to reading on paper

Accessing behaviours – higher access, lower retention Cognitive load Attentiveness - distraction

Subject schemas Domain conception

Sequencing learning – moving backwards and forwards Retention of the 'learning map'

Lower rate of supply of stimulus 'The documentary replacing the essay' – TES Oct 7th

The story from New York – 'they just don't...' and differentiating social life and 'learning'



#### Infant and young learners

inquisitive and curious but little conception of domain structure or specific concepts – the importance of exposure to, and development of, 'complex language'

#### **Adolescents**

more developed persistence combined with developed preferences

#### **Changing social interactions**

Forms of discussion and interaction Shifting power relationships



Currently, specific motivation of young people regarding devices

- Multiple modes of presentation dynamic activities, visual, audio
- Access to materials and data
- Encouraging active engagement
- Distinctive feedback relationships

Systems which respond to learning activities and assessment outcomes

- Social contact during learning and in discussions about learning
- Higher integration of instruction and assessment
- Data capture regarding learners' activities and outcomes
- New modes of assessment including formative and adaptive assessment



## **Practical issues**

Bandwidth

Variation across education system and institutions

Device readiness and reliability

User competence regarding utility and navigation

Application failure

Configuration

Ease of editing is leading to poor attention to content and structure Issues of triage regarding authority of sources

'Losing the learning moment' – the way in which skilled teachers can capitalize on learner engagement and motivation



Are specific resources intended to:

- extend and supplement learning and be used outside contact time - does it structure and support home learning, learning beyond 'timetabled' time on subject, etc – homework diary, copies of worksheets, Isaac Maths, Maths Wizz,
- supply reference material and/or activities which can be used in a highly flexible way by teachers – Youtube

 provide structured activities which support or replace a very specific segment or segments of a learning programme – Pgonline, TSL onlline

 provide a series of activities and content specifications which specify the sequence of learning and condition the learning activities – Pgonline



The variability of learning strategies and the lack of imposed curriculum structure highlights the importance of summative assessment – since learning activities can become more amorphous, there is greater importance in determining with precision the learning which has take place



It is important to note that investment in new digital learning platforms has been extremely high yet, to date, take-up has been low

We do not understand adoption - let alone impact

Empirical studies show clearly that 'digital is different'

There can be no simple assumptions about substitution of existing high quality resources

Curriculum confusions are not helping – Education 2030

Watch labour market return

Be careful what we wish for - we might just get it





## Tim Oates CBE Group Director of ARD



@Cam\_Assessment